

No. DoNER/NLCPR/CXXXVII/2015
Government of India
Ministry of Development of North Eastern Region
(NLCPR-Coord)

Vigyan Bhawan Annexe,
Maulana Azad Road, New Delhi
Dated: 03.11.2015

OFFICE MEMORANDUM

Subject: Minutes of 137th NLCPR meeting held on 24.09.2015 under the Chairmanship of Secretary, DoNER -Regarding.

The undersigned is directed to circulate herewith minutes of 137th NLCPR Committee meeting held on 24.09.2015 at 3.00 p.m in the Committee Room (Room No.243-A, Vigyan Bhawan Annexe), Maulana Azad Road, New Delhi, under the Chairmanship of Secretary, Ministry of Development of North Eastern Region for information and necessary action.

2. This issues with the approval of Hon'ble Minister, DoNER.

Encl: As above.



(K. Doungel)

Under Secretary to the Govt. of India
Tel: 011-23015360

Distribution

1. Dr. Rakesh Sarwal, Pr. Resident Commissioner, Government of Tripura, New Delhi
2. Shri Rajiv Bansal, Pr. Resident Commissioner, Government of Nagaland, New Delhi
3. Dr. Pranati Gogoi, Dy. Resident Commissioner, Government of Assam, New Delhi
4. Resident Commissioner, Government of Manipur, New Delhi
5. Shri Umakant, OSD, Government of Mizoram, Mizoram House, New Delhi
6. Shri Sangeet Dubey, Dy. Resident Commissioner, Government of Arunachal Pradesh, New Delhi
7. Shri Vinod Kumar, OSD, Government of Meghalaya, New Delhi
8. Shri Sanjay Kumar, Director, NITI Aayog, Yojana Bhawan, New Delhi

Copy also to:

1. PS to Hon'ble Minister, DoNER
2. PS to Secretary, DoNER
3. Sr.PPS to JS(VBP)/PPS to JS(JKS)/PS to JS(SLM)
4. Dir(SP)/Dir(RCD)/Dir(BNP)/Dir(VLRK)
5. Web Manager, NIC with a request to upload the minutes on the Ministry's website.
6. Guard file

Government of India
Ministry of Development of North Eastern Region
(NLCPR Wing)

Minutes of the 137th meeting of NLCPR Committee held on 24.09.2015 under the Chairmanship of Dr. R. Vijaykumar, Secretary, Ministry of Development of North Eastern Region in Committee Room No 243 A, Vigyan Bhawan Annexe, New Delhi.

Present

1. Shri Jitendra Kumar Sinha, Joint Secretary, Ministry of DoNER
2. Shri Sanjay Kumar, Director, NITI Aayog
3. Shri S.L. Meena, Joint Secretary, Ministry of DoNER

The following officers were also present in the meeting:

1. Dr. Rakesh Sarwal, Pr. Resident Commissioner, Government of Tripura
2. Shri Rajiv Bansal, Pr. Resident Commissioner, Government of Nagaland
3. Dr. Pranati Gogoi, Dy. Resident Commissioner, Government of Assam
4. Shri Umakant, OSD, Government of Mizoram
5. Ms. N. Kulkarni, Joint Director (Planning), Government of Manipur
6. Shri Sangeet Dubey, Dy. Resident Commissioner, Government of Arunachal Pradesh
7. Shri Vinod Kumar, OSD, Government of Meghalaya
8. Shri S.P. Singh, Director, Ministry of DoNER
9. Shri B.N. Prasad, Director, Ministry of DoNER
10. Shri Ravindra Choudhary, Director, Ministry of DoNER

The representative of Ministry of Home Affairs was absent without information.

After detailed deliberations, the Committee recommended as under:-

Item No.1: Confirmation of the minutes of 136th Meeting of the NLCPR Committee held on 16.09.2015.

The Committee confirmed the minutes of 136th Meeting held on 16.09.2015

Item No.2: Status of DPRs cleared from the Priority Lists 2014-15 of North Eastern State Governments.

The Committee noted that out of 85 projects, which were cleared from the Priority Lists for 2014-15, submitted by the NE State Governments, DPRs for 79 projects have been received in the Ministry of DoNER. Out of 79 DPRs received, 42

DPRs were sent to M/s WAPCOS Ltd. and 23 DPRs to various Line Ministries for obtaining techno - economic appraisal. In respect of the remaining 14 DPRs, the State Governments have been requested to rectify various deficiencies arising in preliminary scrutiny.

The Committee noted that till date, while 4 DPRs have been duly vetted by M/s. WAPCOS Limited, out of the total 42 DPRs sent to them for techno-economic vetting, observations have been made by them in respect of 14 DPRs. The observations mainly pertain to defective structural designs, lack of basic information like population likely to get benefit of the proposed project, traffic density, geo-technical reports etc.

Similarly, 6 DPRs, out of the total of 23 DPRs sent to the concerned Line Ministries for obtaining techno-economic comments, have been vetted till date. While observations have been received in respect of 9 DPRs, techno-economic comments on 8 projects are still awaited.

Secretary, DoNER underscored the need for evolving a mechanism by the NE State Governments for improving the quality of DPRs in respect of the projects cleared by Ministry of DoNER for funding under the NLCPR scheme. He emphasised the need to have software based DPRs to prevent routine errors and defects. He also requested the representatives of the State Governments to expedite furnishing of replies on the observations made by the vetting agencies since September and December were crucial months for disbursement and failure would only reduce the NLCPR funds available.

Item No. 3: Construction of Roads and Bridges in NE Region.

The Committee deferred the matter for further discussion in the next meeting of the NLCPR Committee.

Item No.4: Project, "Upgradation of road from Aizuto Mission to Shena old Saptiqa EAC HQ via Atoizu and Tulo river (retained for 23 kms.)".

The project, 'Upgradation of road from Aizuto Mission Centre to Shena old Saptiqa EAC via Atoizu and Tulo river' was initially proposed for 45 kms at an estimated cost of Rs.81.50 crore. However, the project was retained for an amount of Rs. 23 crore from the Priority List 2013-14, submitted by the Government of Nagaland, in the 121st meeting of the NLCPR Committee held on 18.12.2013. Subsequently, the Government of Nagaland submitted DPR for the project *vide* their letter dated 15th February, 2014 without pointing out that this project now comprised two separate stretches of the road and left out the portion of road for Saptiqa HQ and the bridge on Tulo river as below:

- (a) Aizuto Mission Centre to Atoizu Hqrs. (14 kms.); and
- (b) Philimi Village to Tulo river (9 kms.).

ii) The DPR was forwarded to the Ministry of Road Transport and Highways *vide* Ministry of DoNER O.M. dated 12th January, 2015 for techno-economic vetting. Techno-economic comments of the Ministry of Road Transport and Highways were received *vide* their O.M. dated 20th May, 2015 and 4th June, 2015. Subsequently, the project was considered by the 134th meeting of the NLCPR Committee, held on 26/06/2015 and was recommended for sanction for an amount of Rs. 23.00 crore.

iii) The project was sanctioned *vide* Administrative and Financial Approval dated 10/08/2015. An amount of Rs. 828.00 Lakh has since been released as first instalment of funds *vide* Ministry's sanction letter dated 10/08/2015 and further releases were to be regulated as per terms and conditions contained in the Administrative and Financial Approval and the sanction order releasing first instalment of funds.

iv) Subsequently, this Ministry received a letter dated 25.08.2015 expressing certain reservations about the project, alleging overlapping of the project with that of

another project, "Upgradation of Coco-Doyang Road (NH-61 to Kitsakita via Atoizu, SDO HQ)". On the directions of Secretary, DoNER, the explanation of Chief Secretary, Nagaland was sought and pursued during videoconferencing, which failed to elicit any clarity from the State Government. Following this, the State Government wrote claiming that there was neither any overlapping nor duplication.

v) The NLCPR Committee deliberated on the reply furnished by the Government of Nagaland in respect of the project mentioned above. The scope of the project was also revisited by the Committee. The Committee noted that the project formulation was in violation of the NLCPR scheme Guidelines since upgradation of two separate stretches of roads were shown as a single project nor were the claimed objectives met. There appeared to be clear overlapping with the previous project for which DPR had already been vetted. The Secretary, DoNER had even earlier expressed displeasure in file over the poor and defective formulation of this project. It had also been claimed that the said road is short cut to Kohima without any cogent explanation since no indication of bridge of Tulo river or road to Saptiqa HQ was planned in this full project DPR as proposed..

vi) The file on this case and related cases have now been examined with reference to the detailed map. The Committee noted that while **Phase I** of the earlier project, **Upgradation of Coco-Doyang Road (NH-61 to Kitsa Kita via Atoizu EAC HQ.) 11th to 28th km. (18 kms.)** was sanctioned on 23/12/2010 and documentation stands completed, **Phase II** of the proposed project, which is yet to be sanctioned, plans to connect villages of **Philimi, Rotomi (Old and New), Akhaito, Emlu and Atoizu EAC Hq. (15 kms.)**. The stretch from Atoizu to Kitsa Kita (3kms.) is yet to be retained and could perhaps be **Phase III** by which Atoizu HQ would connect to the GREF road from Mokokchung *via* Aizuto Mission Centre on to Saptiqa HQ and then to Kohima.

vii) In the DPR of **Phase I** of the older project, the road project starts from Rotomi and ends at Khelhoshe Polytechnic (Asukhuto). However, it seems that on ground, the project has been executed from **Coco Doyang Bridge on NH 61 for a stretch of 18 kms.** upto near Philimi village Iperhaps Pukhobokita). The proposed **Phase II** of this

project, which starts from Philimi village and goes upto Atoizu Hq. via Rotomi (Old and New), Akhaito and Emlu, apparently overlaps with a portion of already executed (onground) Phase I of the project.

vii) The project, 'Upgradation of road from Aizuto Mission Centre to Shena old Saptiqa EAC via Atoizu and Tulo river' was apparently developed by GREF and improved thereafter. The present proposal further seeks to upgrade the road from Aizuto Mission Centre to Atoizu after meeting the road from Philimi some distance prior to the Atoizu HQ. This itself suggests a small duplication from this junction to Atoizu between the two projects. Apart from this, the original proposal contemplated rebuilding of the road from Atoizu to Philimi, now seen to be partly developed in the previous project and clearly a duplication.

viii) A mere look at the map shows no road from Tulo river to saptiqa HQ, which suggests issues of techno-economic feasibility. Further, the need to upgrade the road from Philimi to Tulo river, said to be developed by the Irrigation and Power Department and improved by the Rural development Department, has not been clearly indicated. Therefore, too, the possibility of a short cut to Kohima becomes distant.

ix) By the same token, the short road from Atoizu HQ to Kitsa Kita will enable access for the GREF road to Saptiqa HQ and Kohima. This road clearly deserves greater priority rather than vague promises across the Tulo river.

X) In view of the multiple issues involved, the utter lack of clarity of the Nagaland Government and inadequate information supply, all the sections covered in these two project proposals, including completed sections, need careful physical inspection and baseline photography.

xi) It was brought to the notice of the Committee that a Hydro Electric Power project was likely to come on Coco-Doyang river downstream. Hence, the possible

impact of the project and consequent flooding also needs to be assessed quickly so that a considered view in the matter could be taken.

xii) After detailed discussion, the Committee was of the view that besides violating the NLCPR guidelines, the project 'Aizuto Mission Centre to Atoizu HQ (14 Kms.) and Philmi village to Tulo river (9 Kms.)' seems to be overlapping in several sections with Phases I and II of the project, 'Upgradation of Coco-Doyang Road'. Therefore, the Committee directed that all phases of the projects should be inspected on ground by a team of officers from the Ministry and NEC, which shall submit a detailed report to the Ministry at the earliest so that a final view with regard to both the projects could be taken to create infrastructure that could best benefit the public at least costs.

The meeting ended with vote of thanks to the Chair.
